

# OBTC 2017 at Providence College June 14<sup>th</sup> – 17<sup>th</sup>, 2017

# Submission Template

# **SUBMISSION GUIDANCE**

\* Remove all identifying properties from this document \* \* All files must be saved in PDF format \* \*Please include ALL supplementary text at the end of this document\* \*Only one document should be submitted\*

Submission Template for the 2017 OBTC Teaching Conference for Management Educators

# 1) Title, Abstract & Keywords

Title: Building undergraduates' skills to negotiate salary in today's environment

Abstract: New graduates often struggle with whether or not to negotiate their first salary. The purpose of this exercises is to help students understand the different elements that can be negotiated when accepting their first position and build their skills for integrative salary negotiation. Initially designed for a negotiation course or module, the exercise is scoreable to allow students to assess how they did on both integrative and distributive dimensions. The exercise can be modified to remove the scoreable aspect and used in any human resource or organizational behavior course to help students build their salary negotiation skills.

Keywords: self-promotion, negotiation, salary, exercise

# 2) Teaching Implications:

The exercise is designed to help students understand that negotiating their first position involves more than just negotiating salary. It is also designed to teach the students the value of negotiating package deals versus issue by issue (e.g. focusing solely on salary). Initially designed for a module or course in negotiation, the exercise is scoreable to allow students to assess their skill at negotiating both the integrative and distributive dimensions of the exercise. The exercise emphasizes the integrative aspect of negotiation, focusing on the importance of building trust and maintaining good relationships when negotiating salary. Participants must prioritize issues and uncover each other's interests in order to reach a balanced agreement.

The exercise can be used in a course on negotiation or as part of a module within a course on negotiation. It can also be modified and used as a standalone exercise in any human resources of organizational behavior course. We recommend removing the scoreable aspect of the negotiation if used in an organizational behavior or human resources course as this aspect of the exercise is included to teach specific negotiation concepts (see teaching note). The exercise should be followed with a debrief and discussion on whether or not to negotiate salary. Whether used in a negotiation, human resource, or organizational behavior course, the exercise and supporting debrief should help students understand the importance of negotiating salary and build their skill and confidence in this area.

Learning objectives:

- Understand the importance of self-promotion and salary negotiation.
- Learn about the various issues beyond salary that can also be negotiated when accepting your first position.
- Develop skills to persuade and negotiate desired outcomes in work situations.

# 3) Session Description and Plan:

In order to make this an interactive session, we request a 60 minute time slot (if time allows, we could easily fill 90 minutes). We believe that participants will be more comfortable using the exercise in the future if they have first experienced the exercise themselves. Therefore, we have designed the session to be as interactive as possible. Our session outline is:

10 minutes -	Exercise Introduction & Learning Objectives
20 minutes -	Participants negotiate an abbreviated version of the negotiation (actual exercise is attached – See Appendix B - E)
20 minutes -	Demonstration of how to debrief the negotiation and discussion of options for running the negotiation (teaching note attached – See Appendix A)
10 minutes -	Question and Answer session Distribute materials

## 4) Application to Conference theme:

How does your session fit with the overall OBTC theme of *Navigating the Changing Currents*?

This session will help students prepare for the challenge of advocating for themselves outside of the classroom by building the skill and confidence to negotiate salary. Whether to negotiate salary and having the skills to do so is a challenge for most all new graduates. Research shows that some minorities, and women in particular, struggle with self-promotion and negotiate less than their peers, costing them potential thousands of dollars compounded over the course of their careers (Babcock & Laschever, 2007). In an increasingly competitive marketplace, students need to be confident in their ability to advocate for themselves.

# 5) Unique Contribution to OBTC:

This work has not been presented previously nor is it under review anywhere else. These exercises have been used and tested in classroom environment by the authors at their own university but have not been distributed to any other instructors or universities.

### **Citations**

Babcock, L. & Laschever S. (2007). Women Don't Ask: The High Cost of Avoiding Negotiation – and Positive Strategies for Change. Bantam Publishing.

#### **Appendix A: Teaching Note**

#### **Undergraduate Salary Negotiation Exercise**

New graduates often struggle with whether or not to negotiate their first salary. The purpose of this exercises is to help students understand the different elements that can be negotiated when accepting their first position and build their skills for integrative salary negotiation. Initially designed for a negotiation course or module, the exercise is scorable to allow students to assess how they did on both integrative and distributive dimensions. The exercise can be modified to remove the scoreable aspect and used in any human resource or organizational behavior course to help students build their salary negotiation skills. The exercise can also be modified and used in MBA level courses.

Designed for a module or course in negotiation, the exercise is a two-party, six issue scoreable negotiation between a candidate and an employer. There are two compatible (participants want the same outcome), two integrative (participants have differential preferences that can be traded off), and two distributive issues (participants want opposing outcomes for the same issue). There are varying point values across issues. As a result, one party will most always score higher than the other. The highest number of points that an individual could obtain is 10,000. This point total is calculated by adding up the highest number of points each party could receive on the six issues. The highest point value the two parties could achieve working together is 10,600. Most negotiating pairs have a combined score between 7,000 and 9,000 points. The closer to 10,600 the better as this is considered a parietal optimal outcome for this negotiation.

Integrative Issues

- Location
- Division

**Distributive Issues** 

- Starting salary
- Start date

**Compatible Issues** 

- Moving expenses
- Vacation time

#### Running the Exercise

Students are assigned to either the role of the candidate or employer. Participants of both parties are given the confidential role information. Each individual is given the confidential role information for their role. Participants can be handed the material prior to the beginning of class or given 20 minutes in class to prepare. The participants should be told that they are not to share their confidential role information with the other party, under any circumstances. They should also be told not to discuss their preferences in terms of points but rather to discuss them in terms of issues. The participants should be given a maximum of 40 minutes to negotiate the exercise. Once participants have completed their negotiation, they should turn in their final agreement sheet.

#### Debriefing the Exercise

To debrief the exercise, the instructor should draw a chart where participants plot their point values. The instructor can discuss how each participant's individual score indicates performance on distributive dimensions while the participants' combined score indicates performance on the integrative dimension. The instructor can discuss how to create value by prioritizing issues and making tradeoffs. While the total points do not have to be equal between both parties to be a successful outcome, if they favor one party far more than the other (e.g. one person has 2,500 points and the other has 6,000), one party may not feel good about the negotiation and this damages relationship. In this exercise, a point difference of more than 2,500 between the candidate and employer may indicate the relationship was damaged. A balanced agreement is important when one party is going to work for another.

Students may be hesitant to share information, treating this as a competitive negotiation. The key in salary negotiation is to create a positive integrative outcome is for both parties by asking questions and sharing information. It is important to stress to students that if the other side does not know what is important to them they cannot help them. It is also important to discuss the dangers of bluffing (e.g. saying you have another job offer when you do not). A great salary negotiation occurs when both sides are satisfied with the outcome and feel they were treated well during the negotiation process

The instructor should also discuss the importance of planning and setting goals prior to the negotiation. Students should also think carefully about the minimum they are willing to accept (or walk away point). When taught in a course on negotiation, the exercise should be taught in a module of integrative negotiation and be used following the introduction of fundamental concepts such as BATNA (best alternative to a negotiated agreement), Resistance Point and Aspiration Point.

#### **Salary Negotiation Lecture**

Questions to stimulate discussion:

- Why don't people negotiate salary?
  - Don't know their value
    - Do your preparation and know your value!
      - Glassdoor, your career placement office, alumni networking
  - First job don't want to appear greedy
    - Once they decide they want "you" and make you an offer, they have psychologically committed to you and the power shifts to you. Don't discuss salary until you have an offer in writing!
    - Employers often expect you to negotiate and plan for wiggle room. If you're going into a sales or marketing position they might be disappointed if you don't negotiate because you'll have to do that with customers on the job.
  - Afraid of losing an offer
    - It is extremely rare for a company to rescind an offer they have given you in writing. It would only be done if you were far too demanding or unprofessional. You do need to be considerate of the employer's constraints and interests.

- Discuss the cost of not negotiating
  - The loss of \$3,000 in salary, compounded annually adds up quickly all just because you were not comfortable negotiating.
  - Frustration of starting a job and finding out others are making more because they did negotiate.
  - It is especially common for women not to negotiate
- When would you not want to negotiate?
  - If you know your worth and did your research and the company offers you a salary beyond your expectations, you may just want to accept it!

It is also helpful to provide students with resources/current articles on salary negotiation as the ability to effectively negotiate salary can change with the economy. Some books and articles that may be helpful to students:

- 15 Rules for Negotiating a Job Offer by Deepak Malhotra. *Harvard Business Review (2014).*
- Women Don't Ask: The High Cost of Avoiding Negotiation and Positive Strategies for Change by Linda Babcock and Sara Laschever. Bantam Publishing (2007).
- Do You Know How to Get What You're Worth? By Mark Gordon. *Harvard Business Review* (2005).

#### Appendix B: General Information Given to Both Parties

#### **GENERAL INFORMATION – CLEO GURNETT WORLDWIDE**

An icon agency building icon brands, Cleo Gurnett Worldwide is a Top Ten global agency network. The company has 50 offices in 35 countries.

Gurnett values the pursuit of excellence. This passion has helped the firm become one of the top most creative global agencies. Over the years, the firm has helped create some of the world's most valuable brands like McDonald's, Disney, Hallmark and Kellogg's. Chris Carlton is the Director of Account Management. Chris has achieved success by working closely with Disney Corporation to develop new and innovative campaigns that have resulted in unprecedented growth of the brand. Due to this growth, a number of assistant account management positions are open at Cleo Gurnett, all of which report into Chris.

Cleo Gurnett Worldwide is a full-service holistic marketing communication agency. The firm partners with its clients to deliver solutions across every aspect of marketing communications that will build their businesses. The firm's goal is to immerse themselves in their clients' businesses to translate business strategies to communications strategies. They become experts in their clients' target audiences and develop communication programs that will engage consumers in our clients' brands, drive loyalty, and deliver profitable growth.

Specific services Cleo Gurnett Worldwide provides include:

Marketing Research Brand Planning Brand Idea Development Multi-media Campaign Development Multi-media Content Creation Futures Planning

Working at Cleo Gurnett means working with a fascinating blend of sharp, dynamic, witty, restless, and strong-willed people, working to change the way people perceive and interact with brands. As a member of this creatively-charged atmosphere, your opportunity for growth is endless.

# **Terry Hunter**

100 College Avenue College Town, USA Mobile: (303) 661-1000 terry-hunter@college.edu

#### EDUCATION

The State University, College Town

Bachelor of Arts, May 2016. Dean's list for 4 consecutive semesters. Major in communication studies. GPA: 3.52, major GPA: 3.81/4.0.

Significant coursework: media advertising and society, cultural history of advertising, media production, communication theory, organizational communication, journalism

#### EXPERIENCE

#### Marketing Representative

January 2015 – current

College House Hotel & Guest and Event Services, College Town

- Worked on a client team composed of marketers, graphic designers, and web designers
- Researched, developed, and implemented a comprehensive marketing plan for two different clients
- Work with multiple clients on both long and short term marketing and advertising projects

#### Front Room Manager Intern

September 2013 – December 2015

The State University, College Shop, College Town

- Supervisory position, responsible for leading a team of nearly 30 employees
- Managed a retail environment with daily sales often surpassing \$25,000
- Responsible for handling customer service and maintaining customer satisfaction
- Opened/closed the store, ensured a safe and productive work environment
- Promoted to leadership role in less than one year for outstanding performance in leadership responsibilities
- Instrumental in the implementation of a new retail and inventory system
- Trained employees to operate the new system

#### Vice President Administration

September 2014 – August 2015

Greek Community, College Town

- Planned and attended promotional events for both parents and students
- Acted as a liaison between interested students and the Greek houses
- Served as a guide for twenty incoming freshmen during their first months at the University of Iowa

#### LEADERSHIP

- Undergraduate Interfraternity Leadership Academy (2015)
- Promotions team for 10,000 Hour Show (2014 & 2015)
- Dance Marathon Family Representative (2014-2015)
- Optimist International Optimist Chapter Member (2014)
- Run for the Schools Zone Captain (2013)

#### Appendix C: Confidential Role Information for the Employer Role

#### **NEGOTIATOR INSTRUCTIONS: EMPLOYER, CHRIS CARLTON**

This is a negotiation for a job contract. You are playing the role of the employer. Specifically, you are **Chris Carlton**, the director of Account Management at Cleo Gurnett Advertising, a prominent advertising firm based in Chicago.

There are a number of attractive candidates on the market and you have had over 30 applications for the position you advertised for an assistant account executive. You have had preliminary interviews with 4 candidates including **Terry Hunter**, a marketing major who you will be negotiating with today. Terry, who has an impressive resume, is your (and the other directors') preferred candidate and you are prepared to offer Terry the position contingent on your ability to reach agreement on six issues (discussed below). You will be meeting with Terry to begin the negotiation process.

On your "Employer's Payoff Schedule" the 6 issues to be negotiated are listed separately. Along the left-hand side under each issue are five different types of agreements that could be reached. The number of points you will receive for each type of agreement is given on the right hand side. You should note that each issue has a different degree of importance to you, as indicated by the magnitude of the number of points you could obtain. As a negotiator, you may match any of the five levels with any of the 6 issues. Thus, there are a huge number of possible agreements.

Although using points in a negotiation may seem somewhat artificial to you there are a number of reasons for doing so. First, it helps you weigh the issues relative to one another and to see the potential trade-offs among them. Second, having a point system allows you to have objective criteria for evaluating how you are doing in the negotiation. That is, you could set an aspiration level (AL) in terms of how many points you would like to achieve in the negotiation, you could set a reservation price (RP) in terms of the lowest number of points you would be willing to accept before you declare an impasse and seek agreement with some other candidate.

The goal for you in this negotiation is to achieve as many points as possible. The assumption underlying this goal is that an agreement that maximizes your point total would have the highest utility to you and your firm. On the other hand, negotiation assumes give and take and your aspirations should be reasonable (i.e. assuming you could reach 10,000 points – the maximum possible for you – is unrealistic). After all you WANT to hire this candidate and you WANT to have a positive working relationship after the negotiations are over. Being overly aggressive or intractable in your positions would not be in your best interest.

Some underlying reasoning for why you value the different issues and options within the issues as you do is provided on the next page. However, in role-playing negotiations, it is not possible to provide all the potential information or reasoning that you may require. Thus, you may have to improvise and embellish in the course of the negotiation. This is permissible, but please do not change the basic structure of the negotiation (like saying you have another candidate who will work for \$30,000).

#### The issues in order of importance to you:

- <u>Salary</u>: Your evaluation of the market tells you that salaries of \$38,000 to \$46,000 are the norm for entry level advertising positions. In spite of a growing business, your budget is especially tight this year. To the extent that you can keep initial salary low you will have more flexibility on some of the other issues. Also, you like to see a candidate prove him or herself first and you are reluctant to start anyone with the highest salary level. Salary, in fact, is weighted negatively for you; the more you pay the higher the "disutility" for your firm.
- 2. <u>Vacation Time</u>: Time is money!! The fewer vacation days the candidate takes the more productive your firm. Even directors rarely take more than 30 days of vacation. You have the authority to allot anywhere from 5 to 25 days of vacation.
- 3. <u>Job Assignment:</u> You have 5 locations in your company where you could place this individual.

Division A is the main division that focuses on consumer advertising (this is also your fastest growing division).

Division B is an international division that focuses on growing the Europe and Asian markets. Division C is the market research division.

Division D is the direct marketing division focusing on interactive and promotional marketing.

Division E is the brand development division which focuses on brand planning and development.

Given the candidate's background and credentials it would be disadvantageous to you to have him/her anywhere but in Division A.

- 4. <u>The starting date of employment:</u> Your preference for a September 1 starting date is based on the fact that the training programs for new employees begin in September. Most new employees start on this date.
- 5. <u>Location:</u> You have offices in many locations throughout the states. It makes the most sense to you to have the candidate in the Chicago office, as this is the firm's largest office. However, if the candidate has a strong preference for another location this could be accommodated because the employee would be traveling extensively and many meetings take place electronically anyway.
- 6. <u>Moving Expenses:</u> Obviously, the less you have to pay in moving expenses the better. This issue is of least importance to you however.

Your payoff schedule is below. Please become very familiar with your PAYOFF schedule. Feel free to take notes or write on it. The highest number of total points you can obtain from this negotiation is 10,000 and the lowest number is -6,000. These point totals were calculated by adding up the highest number of points you could receive for each of the 6 issues and the lowest number (see table below).

	Lowest	Highest
Job Assignment	0	2400
Vacation Time	0	3200
Starting Date	0	2400
Moving Expense Covered	0	800
Salary	-6000	0
Location		<u>1200</u>
Total	-6000	10,000
Vacation Time Starting Date Moving Expense Covered Salary Location	0 0 -6000 0	3200 2400 800 0 1200

# DO NOT AT ANY TIME TELL THE OTHER PERSON HOW MANY POINTS YOU ARE GETTING. ALSO, DO NOT LET THE OTHER NEGOTIATOR SEE YOUR POINT SCHEDULE. THIS INFORMATION IS FOR YOU ONLY.

Employer Payoff Schedule	
Job Assignment	Points 1
Division E	0
Division D	600
Division C	1200
Division B	1800
Division A	2400
Vacation Time	Points
25 days	0
20 days	800 1600
15 days 10 days	2400
5 days	2400 3600
5 days	5000
Starting Date	Points
July 1	$\frac{10000}{0}$
July 15	600
August 1	1200
August 15	1800
September 1	2400
Moving Expense Coverage	<b>Points</b>
100 %	0
90 %	200
80 %	400
70 %	600
60 %	800

<u>Salary</u>	<b>Points</b>
\$46,000+	-6000
\$44,000	-4500
\$42,000	-3000
\$40,000	-1500
\$38,000	0
Location	Points
London	0
Cincinnati	300
San Francisco	600
New York	900
Chicago	1200

#### Appendix D: Confidential Role Information for the Candidate Role

#### **NEGOTIATOR INSTRUCTIONS: CANDIDATE, TERRY HUNTER**

This is a negotiation for a job contract. You are playing the role of the job candidate. Specifically, you are **Terry Hunter**, a student from the State College of Business, with an emphasis in marketing. You believe yourself to be an attractive and qualified job candidate. You have had a number of interviews, but the position you are most interested in is one at **Cleo Gurnett** Advertising, a prominent Chicago advertising agency. You are especially interested in this firm because you see an opportunity to work on dynamic TV and print advertising campaigns. You will be negotiating with your future boss **Chris Carlton**, Director of Account Management, at Gurnett. Although you are aware that the firm has interviewed other viable candidates besides yourself, your preliminary interview with Chris Carlton went well and you have been invited to discuss a potential job contract. You are prepared to accept a position with Cleo Gurnett Advertising, contingent on your ability to reach agreement on six issues (discussed below).

On your "Candidate's Payoff Schedule" the 6 issues to be negotiated are listed separately. Along the left-hand side under each issue are five different types of agreements which could be reached. The number of points you will receive for each type of agreement is given on the right. You should note that each issue has a different degree of importance to you, as indicated by the magnitude of the number of points you could obtain. As a negotiator, you may match any of the five levels with any of the 6 issues. Thus, there are a huge number of possible agreements.

Although using points in negotiation may seem somewhat artificial to you there are a number of reasons for doing so. First, it helps you weigh the issues relative to one another and to see the potential trade-offs among them. Second, having a point system allows you to have objective criteria for evaluating how you are doing in the negotiation. That is, you could set an aspiration level (AL) in terms of how many points you would like to achieve in the negotiation, you could set a reservation price (RP) in terms of the lowest number of points you would be willing to accept before you declare an impasse and seek other job opportunities.

The goal for you in this negotiation is to achieve as many points as possible. In order to increase your chances of success in this negotiation, you should demonstrate that you will be a model employee: hard-working, cooperative, and productive. To do so, you should make sure your new supervisor is aware of your past accomplishments. Also, be sure to highlight what a hard worker you are and how dedicated you are to the firm's future success. Based on your prior work experience, academic record, and extracurricular activities, you should negotiate the best possible employment package. The assumption underlying this goal is that an agreement that maximizes your point total would have the highest subjective utility to you. On the other hand, negotiation assumes give and take and your aspirations should be reasonable (i.e., assuming you could reach 10,000 points – the maximum possible for you – is unrealistic). After all, you WANT this firm to hire you and you WANT to have a positive working relationship with your supervisor after the negotiations are over. Being overly aggressive or intractable in your positions would not be in your best interest.

Some underlying reasoning for why you value the different issues and options within the issues as you do is provided on the next page. However, in role-playing negotiations, it is not possible to provide all the potential information or reasoning that you may require. Thus, you may have to improvise and embellish in the course of the negotiation. This is permissible, but please do not change the basic structure of the negotiation (like saying you have another firm who will pay you \$60,000 to start).

#### The issues in order of importance to you:

- 1. <u>Salary:</u> This issue is most important to you for a number of reasons. First, you have been in school for the past five years and therefore have some loans to repay. You know that beginning advertising salaries range from \$25,000 to \$40,000 and given your related experience and high grade point, you see no reason why you shouldn't get top dollar.
- 2. Job Assignment: Cleo Gurnett has several different offices across the country.

Division A is the main division that focuses on consumer advertising (this is also the fastest growing division).

Division B is an international division that focuses on growing the Europe and Asian markets. Division C is the market research division.

Division D is the direct marketing division focusing on interactive and promotional marketing.

Division E is the brand development division which focuses on brand planning and development.

Given your background and credentials it would be disadvantageous to you to be anywhere but Division A.

- 3. <u>Moving Expenses:</u> With an advertising firm of this size and reputation you expect nothing less than 100% of moving expenses to be paid.
- 4. <u>Starting Date:</u> Of the five dates suggested the one most preferred by you is July 1. You are currently unemployed and the sooner you can start generating cash the better. Even though a summer vacation would be nice, you simply can't afford to not be working this coming summer.
- 5. <u>Location:</u> Many of your friends from the University of Iowa are moving to Chicago. Therefore, of all the locations you would prefer to be in Chicago, as you already have a potential roommate lined up. New York might be okay too if you were given enough money to live there comfortably. Although you might be interested in working in London in the future, you definitely want to avoid moving out of the country at this point in your career.
- 6. <u>Vacation Time:</u> Five weeks of paid vacation would certainly be great!! You know that it is unlikely that you will start with this many days but you certainly want to try for it.

Your payoff schedule is below. Please become very familiar with your PAYOFF schedule. Feel free to make notes or write on it. The highest number of total points you can obtain from this negotiation is 10,000 and the lowest number is -6,000. These point totals were calculated by adding up the highest number of points you could receive for each of the 6 issues of concern and the lowest number.

	Lowest	Highest
Job Assignment	0	2400
Vacation Time	0	800
Starting Date	0	2400
Moving Expense Covered	0	3200
Salary	-6000	0
Location		<u>1200</u>
Total	-6,000	10,000

#### DO NOT AT ANY TIME TELL THE OTHER PERSON HOW MANY POINTS YOU ARE GETTING. ALSO, DO NOT LET THE OTHER NEGOTIATOR SEE YOUR POINT SCHEDULE. THIS INFORMATION IS FOR YOU ONLY.

	Candidate Payoff Schedule	
Job Assignment	Points	
Division A	2400	
Division B	1800	
Division C	1200	
Division D	600	
Division E	0	
Vacation Time	Points	
25 days	800	
20 days	600	
15 days	400	
10 days	200	
5 days	0	
Starting Date	Points	
July 1	2400	
July 15	1800	
August 1	1200	
August 15	600	
September 1	0	
Moving Expense Covera	-	
100 %	3200	
90 %	2400	
80 %	1600	
70 %	800	
60 %	0	

<u>Salary</u>	<b>Points</b>
\$38,000+	0
\$36,000	-1500
\$34,000	-3000
\$32,000	-4500
\$30,000	-6000
Location	<b>Points</b>
Chicago	1200
New York	900
San Francisco	600
Cincinnati	300
London	0

#### Appendix E: Final Agreement

#### FINAL AGREEMENT

#### PLEASE CIRCLE TO INDICATE THE FINAL NEGOTIATION AGREEMENT

I. We reached a settlement and the settlement was as follows:

JOB ASSIGNMENT:	А	В	С	D	E	(division)
VACATION TIME:	25	20	15	10	5	(days)
STARTING DATE:	7/1	7/15	8/1	8/15	9/1	(date)
MOVING EXPENSE COVERAGE:	100	90	80	70	60	(percentage)
SALARY:	38	40	42	44	46	(thousands of dollars)
LOCATION:	New York	Chicago	London	Cincy	San Francisco	(place)

II. We did not reach settlement. The impasse was due to inability to reach agreement on

Names of negotiators:	
Recruiter:	Points achieved
Candidate:	Points achieved
(You should ask for this information from your	negotiation counterpart after the negotiation is

<u>completed.)</u>